

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
AMARILLO DIVISION

Simon Garcia, Rebecca Garcia, §
Jose Campos, and Christopher Garcia §
§
Plaintiffs, §
§
v. § CIVIL ACTION NO.
§ 2:20-CV-00263-Z
JBS USA Food Co. dba Swift Beef Company, §
Manny Guerrero, Ashley Henning, Jacob §
Montoya, and Donna Estrada, §
§
Defendants. §

**PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY
IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO REMAND AND
OPPOSITIONS TO DEFENDANTS' MOTIONS TO DISMISS**

Plaintiff files this notice of supplemental authority pursuant to the leave granted in the Court's March 31, 2021 order. (Doc. 31).

This case arises out of injuries Plaintiffs received as a result of JBS USA Food Co. dba Swift Beef Company's failures to implement policies and procedures that would have protected Plaintiffs' from contracting COVID-19. Cases arising from similar circumstances involving COVID-19 are also pending in courts throughout the country. Plaintiffs respectfully ask this Court to consider a recent order from the Eastern District of Pennsylvania remanding a factually similar case based on similar arguments Defendants make here. *Benjamin v. JBS S.A.*, 2:20-CV - 02594-JP, 2021 WL 308133 (E.D. Pa. Jan. 29, 2021).¹

In *Benjamin* a meat plant worker's father sued JBS after his son contracted COVID-19 and later died. *Benjamin*, 2021 WL 308133, at *1. The father filed suit in Pennsylvania state

¹ Attached here as Exhibit 1.A.

court asserting five common law causes of action against JBS including negligence, fraudulent and intentional misrepresentation, and wrongful death, and survival. *Id.* at *2. JBS removed the case asserting federal question and diversity jurisdiction. *Id.* Pertinent to the Court's analysis here, JBS in *Benjamin* argued that federal question existed under *Grable & Sons Metal Products, Inc. v. Darue Engineering & Manufacturing*, 545 U.S. 308 (2005). After a thorough analysis, the court denied JBS's *Grable* arguments and ordered the case remanded to state court concluding that:

- “[A] complaint that asserts a state law claim based on the alleged violation of federal regulations is insufficient to necessarily raise a federal issue.” *Benjamin*, CV 20-2594, 2021 WL 308133, at *3, attached as Exhibit 1.A.
- “[T]he complaint is rooted in tort law and refers only to OSHA and CDC *guidance*. Therefore, we conclude that the fact that the Complaint references OSHA and CDC guidelines is insufficient to ‘necessarily raise’ a federal issues as required under the first prong of *Grable*.” *Id.* (emphasis as in original).
- “[N]o statutory or regulatory language is at issue . . . [t]herefore Defendants have not met their burden of showing that any federal issue is actually disputed.” *Id.* at *4.
- “We therefore conclude that the mere existence of the Food Supply Chain Order does not convert Plaintiff’s state law tort claims against his employer and its affiliates into a ‘substantial’ federal issue.” *Id.*
- “[W]e will not risk potentially eviscerating the federal-state balance by asserting federal question jurisdiction over tort claims that arise in the workplace simply because they may involve an employer’s response to COVID-19.” *Id.* at *5.

In light of the Pennsylvania ruling granting remand in the face of issues and arguments almost identical to those before the Court here, Plaintiffs respectfully ask the Court to take judicial notice of this recent order and to consider it as persuasive authority in the analysis on Plaintiffs' motion to remand and in opposition to Defendants' motion to dismiss. For these

reasons, and in addition to all arguments previously raised, Plaintiffs respectfully ask this Court to remand this matter to state court.

Respectfully Submitted,

ARNOLD & ITKIN LLP

/s/ Kurt Arnold

Kurt Arnold

State Bar No: 24036150

karnold@arnolditkin.com

Caj Boatright

State Bar No: 24036237

cboatright@arnolditkin.com

Roland Christensen

State Bar No: 24101222

rchristensen@arnolditkin.com

Joseph McGowin

State Bar No: 24117268

jmcgowin@arnolditkin.com

Claire Traver

State Bar No: 24115871

ctraver@arnolditkin.com

6009 Memorial Drive

Houston, TX 77007

Tel: 713.222.3800

Fax: 713.222.3850

e-service@arnolditkin.com

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the above and foregoing pleading has been electronically filed through the Court's CM/ECF system, which will send notification of electronic filing to all counsel of record on April 5, 2021.

/s/ Joseph McGowin

Joseph McGowin